

A Study of the Differences in Philosophy of Music Education between Remo and Elliott

Yizhi Xi

School of Music, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing, 210023, China

Abstract: *The development of western music education in the second half of the 20th century can be summarized as "point" and "face". "Point" refers to the philosophical perspective on music education represented by Remer's claim of "aesthetic education as the center, while "face" denotes the "multicultural basis" represented by Elliot. To put it in another way, the philosophy of music education is composed of many "points" so as to form "face". This paper compares and develops the two views of music education from three aspects: background of time, case analysis and philosophical basis, in order to contribute to the study of music education.*

Keywords: *Aesthetic, Practice, Multiculturalism, Philosophical Basis*

Reviewing history, Chinese and the Western sages thought about the philosophy of music education as early as several thousand years ago. For example, the discussions of ancient Greek philosopher Plato on the aesthetics and ethics of music in Republic, and the tradition of music education in Zhou Dynasty of China, which reflects the philosophical thinking of music education of ancient Chinese and Western thinkers and educators. The philosophy of music education, as a discipline, was formally established in the United States from the end of the 1980s to the beginning of the 1990s. The philosophy of music education, which is based on philosophy, mainly studies and explores the internal law and essence of music education, which is instructive to all kinds of music educational activities.

1. The Temporal and Spatial Differences in the Philosophy of Music Education between Remo and Elliott

Bennett Remer and David Elliott are both philosophers of music education in the United States. In the seventies of last century, Remer published his book *Philosophy of Music Education*, in which he primarily grounds his views of music education on aesthetic experience. As a student of Remer, Elliott writes the book titled *Problems in Music. A New Philosophy of Music Education* almost 25 years later, which formally put forward the view of music education based on multiculturalism. The author chooses the two music education philosophy views for comparison, because there are distinct comparability between them. We might as well start with the time of writing the book and the international political and economic situation at that time to probe into the condition of the emergence of their philosophical thoughts of music education.

Bennett Remer's book, *The Philosophy of Music Education*, was first published in 1970, suggesting that Remer's writing period should have been before 1970, and the United States was still in a period of "bipolar pattern" in the course of its writing. At that time, the dominant capitalist country was the United States, so it's fair to say that under the influence of such an international political and economic pattern, Remer's "aesthetic experience-centered" philosophy of music education has the characteristics of "unification." The view of the philosophy of music education emphasizes the unity of music education concept, which is based on "aesthetic experience". This concept of "center" is closely related to the "dominance" of politics and economy, and is a manifestation of the influence of politics and economy on culture and ideology. When David Elliott's book *The Problems of Music: A New philosophy of Music Education*, first published in 1995, at the end of the twentieth century, the political and economic landscape of the world has changed from a "bipolar pattern" to a "multipolar world", and it should be said that the "multipolar world" pattern has basically taken shape and is tending to be stable.

2. The Difference Between the Old and the New Philosophy of Music Education Between Remo and Elliott

The "new" corresponds to the "old". Where there is "new", there must be "old". This is a pair of interdependent and independent concepts. Therefore, corresponding to David Elliott's new philosophy of music education based on multiculturalism is the "old philosophy of music education". And the "Old" thus refers to Bennett Remer's "aesthetic experience-centered" philosophy of music education. So where is the new philosophy of music education advocated by Elliot? To answer this question, it is necessary to compare it with Remo's philosophy of "old" music education.

The author takes a case of music appreciation class in senior high school to illustrate the differences between the two views of music education in the specific music teaching practice. The second movement of "the Ninth Symphony" is a music appreciation lesson in the fourth unit "Classical Symphony" in the ninth grade music textbook of compulsory education.

According to Remer, music education must be centered on aesthetic experience, whereas teaching should be centered on Music noumenon. "Music Noumenon" contains the following elements: rhythm, melody, timbre, harmony (including texture), intensity, musical form. Therefore, the teaching objectives of this course are focused on: appreciating the second movement of "the Ninth Symphony" (since the New World), and being able to remember the timbre of the sound state tube on the basis of feeling the musical elements of the music (such as rhythm, melody, harmony, musical form, etc.); Experience the emotional response of the music, associate the musical content of the music, learn and master the basic musical knowledge of symphony. After determining the teaching goal, the teacher will set the corresponding questions and guide the students to listen to the music. It is not difficult to speculate that, according to this teaching objective, the questions mainly revolve around the following aspects: genre of the music, themes in the music, the instruments used in each theme, the musical form of the music, emotions the music expresses, and what the music represents.

Table 1: Example: compulsory education. Grade 9 Music appreciation lesson. Symphony No. 9 (since the New World), 2nd Movement

Idea	Remo. Take the aesthetic experience as the center	Eliot. Based on multiculturalism
Practic		
Teaching objectives	Focusing on the characteristics of the music itself, such as rhythm, melody, harmony, musical form, etc.	Focusing on non-musical factors, such as the relationship between music and politics, culture, religion, folklore
Link setting	Q1: what is the genre of the music? Q2: the music has several themes; Q3: what is the musical instrument used in each passage? Q4: say the musical form of the music; Q5: what emotions are expressed in the music; Q6: what kind of music content does the music represent?	Q1: who is the composer of the music and what nationality he comes from; Q2: what are the folklore, religious and cultural characteristics of the Czech nation? Q3: design actions to express the content of music; Q4: listen to the music and talk about the composer's motivation and the relationship between the work and Czech culture. Q5: what is the influence of Dvorak's personality on the style of his works, and so on

Elliott, on the other hand, is quite different from Remo. Elliott believes that "music originates from human activities", so when we talk about it, we need to let the experiencers participate in music activities, in order to explore the nationality produced by this kind of music and the cultural connotation behind it. Therefore, music educator should also pay attention to music practice, "based on multi-culture", teachers should pay attention to the participation of students and the relationship and influence between music works and culture when guiding students to enjoy music. Focus on the relevance of music to the beliefs, actions, and achievements of the composer (or nation). Then, under the guidance of this idea, the teaching goal of this course is to appreciate the second movement of Symphony No. 9 (since the New World), to know and understand the life and contribution of the composer of the Czech national music school, Dvorak. Understanding the Czech culture, religion and folklore, design music emotion and the content

of the performance of the action, can tell the composer to create a piece of cultural background and creative motivation; Then listen to the works of other ethnic music composers, feel the different national and cultural background, composers created different music styles, and compare the works of different ethnic composers. Well, the setting of classroom questions is mainly around the following aspects: first, who is the composer of the music, which nation; second, what are the folk, religious and cultural characteristics of the Czech nation from; third, listen to the music. Talk about the composer's creative motivation and the relationship between the work and the Czech culture; fourth, what are the factors that affect Dvorak's creation of the work. As shown in the following Table 1.

Through the specific teaching cases presented by the situation, we can feel more intuitive sense of the difference between the two views of philosophy of music education. Generally speaking, Remer focuses on such characteristics of music education as the aesthetic experience and music noumenon, while Eliot focuses on music practice and the social and cultural value of music. Therefore, it can be said that what Remer advocates is a kind of "aesthetic view of music education", which appeals to music works to understand and feel, and tends to a kind of emotional education. Elliott advocates a kind of "practical education". The concept of music education based on multi-culture enables students to participate in music activities and understand the connotation of culture, religion, folklore and society reflected behind the music. This is the basic connotation of Eliot's "New philosophy of Music". The reason for the difference of their ideas is that their theories are based on different philosophies.

3. Differences in Philosophy of Music Education Between Remo and Elliott

As a student of Remo, David Elliott completed his Ph.D. under Bennett Remer's supervision. Facing the concept of "aesthetic education" which had been widely influential at that time, Elliott criticized and questioned Remer's philosophy of music education, and put forward a new philosophy of music education by his acute judgment of the times and the present situation of education. The reason why the two hold completely different views is that they have to analyze from the "source" of their theory, that is, the philosophical basis of the theory.

3.1. The Theoretical core of Remo's Philosophy of Music Education

Remer has published three editions of *Music Education* in the 1970s, 1980s and 1990s. The contents of these three editions covers main philosophy of music education. It is not difficult to find that the theoretical core (or philosophical basis) of Remer's view is the classical epistemology. Compared with modern epistemology, this theory is philosophical epistemology represented by modern philosophy. According to this theory, the subject of cognition is man, and man has subjective initiative, so he will take the initiative to know. The object of cognition is the world. Therefore, we can find that traditional epistemology divides man and the world into two parts, subject and object, which is actually the concrete application of "dualistic epistemology" put forward by the French philosopher Descartes in music education. Therefore, on the basis of this epistemology, Remer takes music works as the aesthetic objects of human beings in his book *The Philosophy of Music Education*, and human beings, as the cognitive subjects with aesthetic ability, explain the relationship between the subject and the object of aesthetics.

3.2. The Logical Fulcrum of Eliot's Philosophy of Music Education

What Elliott advocates is the view of music education based on multiculturalism. In Eliot's theory, the process of music practice and the level of participation is one of the core contents of his philosophy of music education. In addition to music creation, music performance and other musical practice participation, for music works related to the non-noumenon, That is, the cultural and social characteristics of culture, society, religion and folklore reflected in the musical works behind is another important content in Elliott's philosophy of music education. According to Elliott, there are two essential factors to be grasped in music production and performance: one is that music creation should be the core of music education, the other is the need to learn all kinds of knowledge related to music. Therefore, Aristotle's "view of practice" is a theoretical basis for Eliot's philosophy of music education. In addition, Spassute and others systematically criticized the view of aesthetic music. The thesis of "expanding the Cognitive Dimension of Music in many aspects" clearly put forward by Alpson in 1991 has made a lot of theoretical support and foreshadowing for the formation of Eliot's "practical view of music".

4. The Enlightenment of Remo and Elliott's Philosophy of Music Education in China.

Based on what has been demonstrated above, it is not difficult to find that Remo and Elitoll's philosophy of music education has its advantages and disadvantages, *In* contrast, the status of music education in China, music as a discipline, compared to the eighties and nineties of the last century and the first decade of this century, significantly improved. In the formulation of curriculum standards, taking the 2011 *edition* of the primary school music curriculum standards as an example, the goal of music education is set as "to play an important role in cultivating students' good aesthetic taste and humanistic quality". This goal synthesizes Remo and Elliott's view of music education and combines the advantages of their philosophy of music education. The author thinks that this music subject goal proposed, is the science. In the concrete operation aspect, the author thinks: the music education is has "the esthetic nature", listens to the music work and to its music essential factor analysis is essential, this is helpful to help the people "understand" the music from the "rational" angle; So as to improve their aesthetic ability. Hut music is not only synonymous with "musical works", but also composers, as well as the social, cultural, folklore, religious, political and other factors behind the works that affect the creation of music. These factors endow the musical works with another unique attribute-nationality, Therefore, it is also necessary to have extensive understanding and contact with the music of different nationalities and different cultures. This is conducive to broaden people's understanding of different nationalities and different cultures, and respect for cultural diversity, so as to improve their own humanistic literacy, Therefore, for the present stage *of* music education in China, combining the strong points of Remo and

Elliott's view of music education, we need "aesthetic ability" and "humane accomplishment" to keep the "balanced development" of music education.

References

- [1] JMeng Cal, *Why should we develop the philosophy oi music education? Interpretation based on HenneU Reiner's philosophy of Music Education [J].people's Music*, 2015, (08): 64-66.
- [2] Meng Cai. *Cognition of the connotation of "Music Art" and "Music Education- based on Bennett Reimmer's philosophy of Music Education [J]*, *Chinese Musicology*, 2015,(03): 113-118.
- [3] Miao Zhu. *Update and persistence-the philosophy of Music Education: advancing the Vision [D]*. Shanghai normal University, 2014.
- [4] Fanjia Meng. *Research on Reimmer's Musical Education thought and practice [D]*. China Conservatory of Music, 2014.
- [5] Xiaoyu Chen, Ma Yining. *From Pure experience to Fusion: an interpretation of Remo's Aesthetic philosophy of Music Education [J]*. *Journal of Xinjiang University of Art*, 2013, (02): 50-55.
- [6] Hongyan Wang. *On the influence of Music Education philosophy on basic Music Education in China [J]*. *Chinese Music*, 2010, (04): 203-206.
- [7] Chen Du. *Understanding and thinking of "taking Music Aesthetics as the Core"[D]*. Southwest University, 2010.
- [8] Cilin Zhao. *Critical thinking on the philosophy of Music Education: interpretation of the basic Concepts of "Music Problems-A New philosophy of Music Education" [J]*. *People's Music*, 2009, (10): 68-70.
- [9] Bingqi Zhou. *Philosophical speculation on Music Education: Reimmer's philosophy of Music Education [J]*. *Music Exploration*, 2009, (01): 80-82.
- [10] Zhenzhen Qu. *Deciphering the New Curriculum Standard of Music Education in Primary and Secondary Schools with Remer's philosophy of Music Education [J]*, *Jiangsu Social Sciences*, 2008, (SI): 195-198.
- [11] JiangmeiQin. *Aesthetic Paradigm and practical Paradigm of philosophy of Music Education [D]*. Nanjing normal University, 2008.
- [12] Jiangmei Qin. *A Review of Remer's philosophy of Aesthetic Music Education from three Editions of philosophy of Music Education [J]*. *Journal of the Central Conservatory of Music*, 2008, (02): 138-144.
- [13] Jiangmei Qin. *Music Education is Aesthetic Education. A Review of Bennett Remer's philosophy of Music Educational [J]*. *Foreign Educational Research*, 2007: 23-27.
- [14] Jing Su. *A probe into the Road of Music Education Reimmer's philosophy of Music Education [J]* *Arts Education*, 2007, (03): 34-35.
- [15] Guofu Chen. *Reimmer's philosophy of Music Education [J]*. *Journal of Nanjing Institute of Arts (Music and performance Edition)*, 2005, (04): 118-121.
- [16] Hongyan Luo. *Philosophy, the theoretical Cornerstone of Music Education: reading Remmer's philosophy of Music Education [J]*. *People's Music*, 2005, (02): 54-56.

- [17] Jian Yang. *The ideal of a Music educator: an interpretation of Remmer's philosophy of Music Education* [J]. *Huang Zhong (China) Journal of Wuhan Conservatory of Music*, 2004, (SI): 132-135.
- [18] Hongyan Luo. *Philosophy, the theoretical Cornerstone of Music Education: reading Remmer's philosophy of Music Education* [J]. *Art Studies*, 2004, (04): 29-30.
- [19] Ling Wang. *On Eliot's philosophy of practical Music Education* [J]. *Huang Zhong (China) Journal of Wuhan Conservatory of Music*, 2013, (03): 126-130.
- [20] Hong Lin, Jianhua Guan. *A Cultural Analysis of the Postmodern turn of Elliott's Musical Education thought* [J]. *Chinese Music*, 2011, (03): 15-24 + 42.
- [21] Yingyu Li. *David Elliott's philosophy of practical Music Education and its Enlightenment* [J]. *Science of Education*, 2010, (05): 94-96.
- [22] Xiuping Wang. *On the academic Nature of the Translation of academic works: a Review of the Translation of concerned Music Practice—New philosophy of Music Education* [J]. *People's Music*, 2010, (04): 76-78.
- [23] Da Ma. *David Elliott and his View of practical Music Education* [J]. *People's Music*, 2009, (05): 60-63.
- [24] Jianhua Guan. *Eliot's postmodern music pedagogy thought* [J]. *Chinese Musicology*, 2004, (03): 86-89.
- [25] By David Elliott, translated by Xue Qi and Dafu Lai. *Paying attention to Music practice: new philosophy of Music Education* [M], Shanghai Music Publishing House, February 2009.
- [26] Bennett Remer, translated by Lei Xiong. *Philosophy of Music Education-advancing Vision (3 Rd Edition)* [M]. People's Music Publishing House, August 2011.
- [27] Guan Jianhua. *Postmodern music pedagogy* [M]. Shaanxi normal University Press, April 2006.