

# The Literacy Development of English Language Learners in Transitional Bilingual Education Program

Li Liu<sup>1,a,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>*School of Foreign Languages, Qilu Normal University, Jinan, China*

<sup>a</sup>*liuli@qlnu.edu.cn*

<sup>\*</sup>*Corresponding author*

**Abstract:** *This literature review mainly examines the empirical researches on the Spanish and English literacy development and achievement of the English language learners in the transitional bilingual education program compared with the students in the English-only programs. Spanish-speaking English language learners in transitional bilingual programs are provided with not only introductions in English as a second language but also their native language support in their academic study. In addition, bilingual instructions of teachers have also been investigated to understand how they influence the literacy development of the English language learners, including their Spanish oral proficiency, morphological awareness, and writing skills cross-language relations between English and Spanish. Spanish language learning and Spanish instructions that Spanish-speaking English language learners received did not hinder their English performances.*

**Keywords:** *literacy development, transitional bilingual education*

## 1. Introduction

There were 3.9 million English language learners (ELLs) who speak Spanish in the United States, which accounted for 7.9% of all public school students in 2019. ELLs are linguistically and culturally varied, and with diverse academic levels and language proficiency, while 44% of the ELLs are in pre-kindergarten to Grade 3 <sup>[1]</sup>. As the currently most popular bilingual program utilized in the United States, transitional bilingual education (TBE) programs “provide students with English as a second language instruction and academic support in the students’ native language, with native language instruction gradually decreasing and eventually eliminated as ELLs acquire more and more English” <sup>[2]</sup>. Among the bilingual programs, TBE programs are acknowledged as the most common type of bilingual education program that has been funded in the United States and the most used in the United States <sup>[3]</sup>.

Literacy is a developmental process, and bilingual students’ literacy acquisition is individual and various in their first and second languages <sup>[4]</sup>. Literacy acquisition in the second language can be facilitated in the environment where the native language is used. Although there have been studies focus on English literacy development of Spanish-speaking children in other types of bilingual education programs <sup>[5]</sup>, there are not many studies investigate Spanish and English literacy development of Spanish-speaking children, especially in TBE programs.

The Hispanic ELLs account for 90% of all the ELLs in the United States <sup>[6]</sup>. Among these ELLs, over two million Spanish-speaking children account for the largest proportion of those who have difficulty in speaking English <sup>[7]</sup>. The literacy development of Spanish-speaking ELLs is worth the investigation.

## 2. Research Questions

This literature review examined the Spanish and English literacy development and achievement of Spanish-speaking children in the TBE programs which are currently popular in the United States. This literature review addressed the following aspects:

- (1) The English literacy development of ELLs in TBE program.
- (2) The Spanish literacy development of ELLs in TBE program.

### 3. Literature and Theoretical Framework

This literature review used the cross-linguistic transfer as the theoretical framework. Cross-language transfer is to explain literacy and language development of language minority children. Children's development of second language skills is dependent on their proficiency of first language skills<sup>[8]</sup>. Cross-linguistic transfer is the fact that skills and knowledge in one language can be approached and applied in another language<sup>[9]</sup>. Those who are biliterate are more probably to gain metalinguistic insights into language and linguistics structures. Language transfer requires sufficient exposure to the second language and their motivation of learning the language.

Children can establish two separate language systems, and the two linguistic systems can interact to the emerging bilinguals. Cross-linguistic transfer happens from the proficient language to the non-proficient language because these bilingual children usually demonstrate imbalanced development in the two languages. Bilingual children can apply knowledge of phonology and grammar in the dominant language to the nondominant language. Cross-linguistic transfer can be considered as a natural outcome commonly occurred in bilingual language learning<sup>[10]</sup>. The following researches demonstrated that the ELLs can apply their Spanish phonological awareness skills to English literacy development.

Researchers examined Spanish-speaking preschoolers in dual language program who will transmit to English-only classrooms in the first grade. They had examined 248 dual language speakers of Spanish and English for five years from preschool to the third grade. Their English and Spanish were measured every year and results showed that first language (Spanish) and second language (English) oral skills contributed to second language (English) word reading. Results also showed that first language (Spanish) skills predicted second language (English) oral and reading achievement<sup>[11]</sup>.

Another research also supported the cross-linguistic transfer<sup>[12]</sup>. They examined seventy children including English speakers and Spanish and English bilinguals receiving English instruction and having similar IQ in Michigan, and investigated whether Spanish phonological awareness and phonological reading skills could contribute to the bilinguals' English literacy development. Results from the tests showed that Spanish oral and written language proficiency of ELLs directly and positively influenced their English literacy proficiency. English phonological awareness was significantly associated with their English reading abilities to the monolinguals and bilinguals. Findings showed that phonological awareness in English and Spanish of bilinguals demonstrated significant support to English word reading. Similarities between Spanish and English could contribute to the literacy development of bilinguals.

Their findings were supported by a meta-analysis that examined within-language and cross-language relationship between oral language proficiency of bilingual children with immigrant backgrounds and their school achievement<sup>[13]</sup>. Findings showed that oral language proficiency of bilingual students had significant within-language relationship with their school outcomes. Findings also showed that first-language oral proficiency had positive cross-language relations with the early literacy outcomes of second language. The orthography is transparent between Spanish and English languages, which enables better phonological awareness of bilinguals of the two languages<sup>[14]</sup>.

Except for phonological awareness, morphological awareness skills can also transfer between the two languages. A quantitative research in two elementary schools in the United States compared the Spanish morphological awareness development and vocabulary acquisition between English-speaking children in general education program and Spanish-speaking children in dual language program in the fourth grade<sup>[15]</sup>. Results also showed that cross-language transfer happened among Spanish-and English-speaking children. Findings indicated that bilingual education could positively influence the morphological awareness of ELLs by taking advantage of cross-language transfer and sensitivity to structure language.

Writing skills can also transfer between languages, especially between languages with similar writing systems, such as English and Spanish<sup>[16]</sup>. Besides, a quasi-experiment on 200 elementary school students compared writing performance of emergent bilinguals in Spanish and English bilingual programs<sup>[17]</sup>. The acquisition of one language can support a second language learning to the writing outcomes. Cross-linguistic transfer happened between Spanish and English in terms of phonological awareness, morphological awareness, vocabulary acquisition, and writing skills.

#### **4. The English and Spanish Literacy Development of ELLs**

##### ***4.1 English Literacy Development of ELLs***

The following studies examined the English literacy development of Spanish-speaking ELLs in TBE program compared with that of ELLs in other programs. A longitudinal study with random sampling examined the English literacy and language achievement of Spanish-speaking ELLs from kindergarten to the third grade in an urban area in Southwest of the United States<sup>[18]</sup>. Results from ELLs' English proficiency in terms of vocabulary, listening and reading comprehension and language, and their Spanish proficiency showed that there was no significant difference of achievement between TBE and TBE enhanced programs.

Another three-year longitudinal study examined the English reading performance of 214 Spanish-speaking ELLs in the first grade in Oregon<sup>[19]</sup>. Three schools used Spanish and English instructions from kindergarten to third grade while nine schools chose only English instructions. They compared ELLs' English oral reading fluency and reading performance of ELLs in the two programs. Findings showed that ELLs who received Spanish and English paired instructions have equal or even better reading achievement than those received English-only instruction. Bilingual approach is more beneficial to reading fluency of ELLs compared with the reading comprehension. ELLs in bilingual program also made greater progress in oral reading fluency than their counterparts in the English-only program.

A mixed-methods research which lasted for three years from kindergarten to second grade examined ELLs of the second-grade and compared their English literacy in TBE and English-only program in California<sup>[20]</sup>. The results from oral and reading English and their home language proficiency tests, class observations, interviews of teachers, parent questionnaires showed that ELLs' knowledge of home language promoted their English literacy development. ELLs had equal achievement in English reading comprehension as English-only speakers and even outperformed them in word-decoding skills, but scored lower in vocabulary than native English speakers. Meanwhile, Spanish-speaking children had average Spanish reading comprehension, lower Spanish vocabulary achievement.

These researches examined the English literacy of Spanish-speaking ELLs in TBE program compared with that of ELLs in TBE enhanced programs and English-only programs. Results showed that the English reading performance and oral reading fluency of ELLs in TBE are no worse than those in other programs.

##### ***4.2 Spanish Literacy Development of ELLs***

Spanish has been used in most of the bilingual programs because there are a lot of Hispanic students and bilingual teachers are available<sup>[21]</sup>. Literacy in Spanish language paved the foundation for English speaking and reading in TBE programs. Although English proficiency has been the focus of the TBE program, there are still studies examined the Spanish literacy proficiency of ELLs.

A longitudinal study examined Latino children's Spanish and English literacy development and achievement<sup>[22]</sup>. The research investigated Latino students in bilingual, Spanish, and English programs. The data collected from second grade to fifth grade showed that instruction language considerably influenced Spanish reading of students in the four grades; however, students in Spanish-only and bilingual programs had equal performances in Spanish reading while they exceeded their counterparts in English-only program. Students in the bilingual program performed equally in English reading as those in English-only program, which indicated that English literacy development was not hindered by Spanish instructions. Students in the bilingual program reaped the benefits of bilingualism and biliteracy, their Spanish reading proficiency decreased though.

A longitudinal and experimental research on thirty-one Spanish-dominant preschoolers and examined their Spanish and English language and literacy development in the TBE program<sup>[23]</sup>. These participants were randomly assigned to experiment group with Spanish and English instruction, and control group with English instruction. They examined the relationship between instructional language and five dependent variables, receptive and expressive language of Spanish and English, phonological awareness of English and Spanish, receptive vocabulary, early English reading achievement, and early English literacy achievement. Findings showed native-language support in the TBE program could enhance English and Spanish literacy skills of Spanish-speaking children, and facilitate receptive and expressive development of Spanish vocabulary. Findings also demonstrated that Spanish support did not impede English development of young bilingual learners.

Spanish-skills development of ELLs were examined in the two programs, TBE and two-way dual language. This study was conducted in an elementary school in the United States and recruited Spanish-speaking children with low social and economic status in the first and second grades <sup>[24]</sup>. They tested ELLs' Spanish literacy proficiency including alphabet, listening, reading, writing, and verbal expression twice a year. Findings showed that dual language approach could facilitate verbal expression skills of the second graders in their native language (Spanish), which indicated that the amount of instruction time could influence literacy development. Native-language support in the TBE program could enhance English and Spanish literacy skills of Spanish-speaking children, and facilitate receptive and expressive development of Spanish vocabulary. Findings also demonstrated that Spanish support did not impede English development of young bilingual learners.

A longitudinal experiment with randomly sampling and examined English literacy and language achievement of Spanish-dominant ELLs in Southeast Texas <sup>[25]</sup>. Results from oral and reading performances of the ELLs in the kindergarten and first grade showed that bilingual students had significant improvement in Spanish and English oral and reading development. However, their Spanish oral development outperformed their English oral proficiency while English reading proficiency outscored their Spanish reading development. Findings also showed that their Spanish development outperformed their English development in terms of Spanish oral proficiency and English reading comprehension.

#### ***4.3 Instructions and Literacy Development of ELLs***

There have been also studies examined the quality of instructions in the TBE program and their influences on the English and Spanish achievement of Spanish-speaking ELLs. ELLs should be provided with more time and instruction supports to enable them achieve English proficiency so as to prepare them for academic success <sup>[26]</sup>.

The biliteracy development of children receiving bilingual instructions in a bilingual program and those receiving English instructions in an English program from preschool to second grade have been compared to investigate whether instruction language influences their language and literacy achievement, and whether there is relationship between their English literacy and their Spanish proficiency <sup>[27]</sup>. These children were Spanish-speaking children with low social and economic status. Results showed that children from Spanish homes with low social and economic status demonstrated quite low English and Spanish proficiency. Their parent education significantly influenced their children's English proficiency rather than the Spanish speaking proficiency. Findings also showed that most participants who received bilingual instructions across these four grades showed similar English achievement compared with those in the English-only program. They also found that literacy skills and academic language may transfer from Spanish to English to help the ELLs to acquire biliteracy. They also concluded that Spanish language proficiency of the ELLs was relative to their English proficiency. Thus, ELLs can take advantage of bilingual instructions.

In addition, ELLs have been found to have poorer performances in early literacy than their non-ELLs even though ELLs' English oral and reading improve over time <sup>[28]</sup>. To address the poor performance of ELLs who are Spanish-dominant, they conducted a meta-analysis about three approaches to instruction language in English reading, and examined which one was the most effective to improve reading proficiency of ELLs in elementary schools. Results from thirteen studies showed that the quality of instructions in these programs was more influential than the language used in the instructions. Findings also demonstrated that no differences have been found in reading outcomes of ELLs in TBE, English-only and dual language programs. They also found that there were some practical and effective strategies to improve ELLs' English reading, such as cooperative learning, one-to-one tutoring, and small group study.

Similarly, a longitudinal study and used randomly assigned the Spanish-speaking first graders with low performance in reading fluency to two groups in Texas <sup>[29]</sup>. The study examined the influence of English language intervention to these Spanish-speaking children in the first grade. Findings showed that pretests and posttests on word and sentence reading, vocabulary, listening comprehension and wording meaning showed that no significant differences had been found in the English reading performance of these participants. Findings indicated that teachers spent different amount of time on reading instruction, which did not influence the reading outcomes.

There are also studies emphasize the importance of quality of instruction instead of the language of instruction. A longitudinal and field-based research and examined how educators improve academic oral

English proficiency of 800 Spanish-speaking ELLs with low social and economic status, and how the two programs, TBE and structured English immersion (SEI) programs facilitate their oral English development in Texas<sup>[30]</sup>. Twenty-eight schools were randomly selected to implement two programs for these ELLs. Tests results from their vocabulary and listening comprehension collected from the beginning and end of kindergarten as well as end of first grade showed that these programs can significantly benefit oral English development of ELLs. Findings also showed that learning in Spanish did not impede their English learning, and effective instructions were beneficial to ELLs' English development. They found that ELLs in TBE program had poorer oral English achievement than those in SEI program by the end of first grade. The study implied that quality of instruction was important in the acceleration of their oral English proficiency.

Language used at home, and instruction language at school influenced English literacy development of Spanish-speaking ELLs. The importance of quality of instruction in ELLs' reading development. ELLs who received Spanish and English paired instructions have equal or even better reading achievement than those received English-only instruction. ELLs in bilingual program also made greater progress in oral reading fluency than their counterparts in the English-only program. ELLs who received Spanish and English paired instructions have equal or even better reading achievement than those received English-only instruction.

Spanish-dominant students from six states in the United States were randomly assigned to TBE and SEI programs<sup>[31]</sup>. Students in TBE only received Spanish instructions in the kindergarten and then transit to English instructions from the second and third grades while students in SEI program had English instructions. Findings from the pretests and posttests of English and Spanish reading showed that students of the fourth grade who learned Spanish reading for three years had equal performances as those received English-only instructions in terms of Spanish reading. Findings also showed that students in SEI program did outperform their counterparts in TBE program in the early grades, but their reading performance was no better than those in the TBE program.

In conclusion, the amount of instruction time could influence literacy development. Dual language instruction could be beneficial to English competency and academic achievement through the emphasis on home languages of ELLs. Dual language instruction could be beneficial to English competency and academic achievement through the emphasis on home languages of ELLs. They concluded that to ELLs, importance should be attached to the quality of instructions instead of the language used in the instructions. Thus, the time spent on instruction and the quality of instructions should be taken into consideration when examining the relationship between instruction and literacy development.

## 5. Conclusions

This literature review examined the English and Spanish literacy development and achievement of Spanish-speaking ELLs in the TBE program and the following results have been achieved based on the cross-linguistic transfer theoretical framework. Cross-linguistic transfer happened between English and Spanish language and literacy learning. Literacy skills and academic language may transfer from Spanish to English to help the ELLs to acquire biliteracy. Similarities between Spanish and English could contribute to the literacy development of bilinguals.

First, Spanish-speaking ELLs have equal or even better reading achievement than those received English-only instruction in the TBE programs. ELLs in bilingual program also made greater progress in oral reading fluency. ELLs' knowledge of Spanish language promoted their English literacy development. ELLs had equal achievement in English reading comprehension as English-only speakers and even outperformed them in word-decoding skills, but scored lower in vocabulary than native English speakers. English phonological awareness and orthographic knowledge can predict Spanish-speaking ELLs' reading outcomes in first grade so that early intervention can be administered to the ELLs to improve their English reading.

Second, native-language support in the TBE program could enhance English and Spanish literacy skills of Spanish-speaking children, and facilitate receptive and expressive development of Spanish vocabulary. Dual language approach could facilitate Spanish verbal expression skills of ELLs. English and Spanish literacy performances in TBE program and other bilingual programs demonstrated that Spanish language learning and Spanish instructions that Spanish-speaking ELLs received did not hinder their English performances across different grades in elementary school. There were significant differences between Spanish and English writing achievements in the first and second grades, but these differences cannot be detected after the third grade.

Third, more time spent on literacy instruction could lead to differences in their literacy outcomes, and academic performances. For example, one year is insufficient to help ELLs equally performed as their counterparts in English-only programs. The English improvement was found to be cumulative and could be completed for four or five years.

Compared with TBE program, paired literacy instruction could be beneficial to the biliteracy development of Spanish-speaking ELLs, and their writing performances. It indicated that paired literacy instruction could benefit ELLs when it started earlier and lasted for a long term. Explicit instructions in different aspects of literacy, such as word reading, oral reading fluency, vocabulary learning, reading comprehension, and writing are beneficial to ELLs.

In addition, ELLs can take advantage of bilingual instructions. Bilingual instructions can result in “equal or better academic outcomes than English-only instructions”<sup>[32]</sup> with only few exceptions. The studies showed that the more bilingual instructions the ELLs receive, the better their academic achievement will be. However, studies also revealed the importance of the quality of instruction in the TBE program. Quality of instructions in these programs was more influential than the language used in the instructions.

To enhance the effectiveness of TBE programs implemented now in the United States, the teachers and administrators need to collaborate with each other and improve not only the time spent on native-language instructions but also the quality of instructions to improve the ELLs’ English and native language proficiency and academic outcomes.

### Acknowledgement

Fund project: Undergraduate Teaching Reform Project of Qilu Normal University in 2022: “Comparative Study and Classroom Teaching Reform of Information Technology Courses in the Training of Normal University Students” (Project No. JG202226).

### References

- [1] Wolf, M. K., Kao, J., Griffin, N., Herman, J. L., Bachman, P. L., Chang, S. M. and Farnsworth, T. (2008). *Issues in Assessing English Language Learners: English Language Proficiency Measures and Accommodation Uses. Practice Review (Part 2 of 3). CRESST Report 732. National Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards, and Student Testing (CRESST).*
- [2] Gottlieb, M. H. and Nguyen, D. (2007). *Assessment and Accountability in Language Education Programs: A Guide for Administrators and Teachers. Caslon Pub. p.4*
- [3] DeNicolo, C. P. (2016). *School within a School: Examining Implementation Barriers in a Spanish/English Transitional Bilingual Education Program. Bilingual Research Journal, 39(2), 91-106.*
- [4] Brisk, M. E., & Harrington, M. M. (2010). *Literacy and Bilingualism: A Handbook for All Teachers. Thousand Oaks, CA: Routledge.*
- [5] Han, M., Silva, L., Vukelich, C., Buell, M. and Hou, L. (2014). *Development of Early English Language and Literacy Skills among Spanish-Speaking Children: Does Preschool Make a Difference? Early Child Development and Care, 4, 537-552.*
- [6] Umansky, I. M. and Reardon, S. F. (2014). *Reclassification Patterns among Latino English Learner Students in Bilingual, Dual Immersion, and English Immersion Classrooms. American Educational Research Journal, 5, 879-912.*
- [7] Lindholm-Leary, K. (2014). *Bilingual and Biliteracy Skills in Young Spanish-Speaking Low-SES Children: Impact of Instructional Language and Primary Language Proficiency. International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, 2, 144-159.*
- [8] Cummins, J. (1979). *Linguistic Interdependence and the Educational Development of Bilingual Children. Review of Educational Research, 49, 222 – 251.*
- [9] Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, Power, and Pedagogy: Bilingual Children in the Crossfire. Buffalo, NY: Multilingual Matters.*
- [10] Goldstein, B. A. (2004). *Bilingual Language Development and Disorders in Spanish-English Speakers. Baltimore, MD: Brookes Publishing Company.*
- [11] Language and Reading Research Consortium, Mesa, C. and Yeomans-Maldonado, G. (2019). *The Role of Prekindergarten Spanish in Predicting First-Grade English Word Reading among Dual-Language Learners. Journal of Speech, Language, and Hearing Research, 1-20.*
- [12] Kremin, L. V., Arredondo, M. M., Hsu, L. S. J., Satterfield, T. and Kovelman, I. (2019). *The Effects of Spanish Heritage Language Literacy on English Reading for Spanish–English Bilingual Children in the US. International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism, 2, 192-206.*

- [13] Prevoo, M. J., Malda, M., Mesman, J. and van IJzendoorn, M. H. (2016). *Within-and Cross-Language Relations between Oral Language Proficiency and School Outcomes in Bilingual Children with an Immigrant Background: A Meta-Analytical Study*. *Review of Educational Research*, 1, 237-276.
- [14] Hoff, E. (2013). *Interpreting the Early Language Trajectories of Children from Low-SES and Language Minority Homes: Implications for Closing Achievement Gaps*. *Developmental Psychology*, 1, 4.
- [15] Kuo, L. J., Ramirez, G., de Marin, S., Kim, T. J. and Unal-Gezer, M. (2017). *Bilingualism and Morphological Awareness: A Study with Children from General Education and Spanish-English dual Language Programs*. *Educational Psychology*, 2, 94-111.
- [16] Soltero-González, L., Sparrow, W., Butvilofsky, S., Escamilla, K. and Hopewell, S. (2016). *Effects of a Paired Literacy Program on Emerging Bilingual Children's Biliteracy Outcomes in Third Grade*. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 1, 80-104.
- [17] Butvilofsky, S. A., Hopewell, S., Escamilla, K. and Sparrow, W. (2017). *Shifting Deficit Paradigms of Latino Emerging Bilingual Students' Literacy Achievement: Documenting Biliterate Trajectories*. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 2, 85-97.
- [18] Spies, T. G., Lara-Alecio, R., Tong, F., Irby, B. J., Garza, T. and Huerta, M. (2018). *The Effects of Developing English Language and Literacy on Spanish Reading Comprehension*. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 5, 517-529.
- [19] Baker, D. L., Park, Y., Baker, S. K., Basaraba, D. L., Kame'enui, E. J. and Beck, C. T. (2012). *Effects of a Paired Bilingual Reading Program and an English-Only Program on the Reading Performance of English Learners in Grades 1-3*. *Journal of School Psychology*, 6, 737-758.
- [20] Uchikoshi, Y. and Maniates, H. (2010). *How Does Bilingual Instruction Enhance English Achievement? A Mixed-Methods Study of Cantonese-Speaking and Spanish-Speaking Bilingual Classrooms*. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 3, 364-385.
- [21] Farver, J. A. M., Lonigan, C. J. and Eppe, S. (2009). *Effective Early Literacy Skill Development for Young Spanish-Speaking English Language Learners: An Experimental Study of Two Methods*. *Child Development*, 3, 703-719.
- [22] Proctor, C. P., August, D., Carlo, M. and Barr, C. (2010). *Language Maintenance Versus Language of Instruction: Spanish Reading Development among Latino and Latina Bilingual Learners*. *Journal of Social Issues*, 1, 79-94.
- [23] Durán, L., Roseth, C., Hoffman, P. and Robertshaw, M. B. (2013). *Spanish-Speaking Preschoolers' Early Literacy Development: A Longitudinal Experimental Comparison of Predominantly English and Transitional Bilingual Education*. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 1, 6-34.
- [24] Murphy, A. F. (2014). *The Effect of Dual-Language and Transitional-Bilingual Education Instructional Models on Spanish Proficiency for English Language Learners*. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 2, 182-194.
- [25] Tong, F., Lara-Alecio, R., Irby, B. J. and Mathes, P. G. (2011). *The Effects of an Instructional Intervention on Dual Language Development among First-Grade Hispanic English-Learning Boys and Girls: A Two-Year Longitudinal Study*. *The Journal of Educational Research*, 2, 87-99.
- [26] Miley, S. K. and Farmer, A. (2017). *English Language Proficiency and Content Assessment Performance: A Comparison of English Learners and Native English Speakers Achievement*. *English Language Teaching*, 9, 198.
- [27] Lindholm-Leary, K. (2014). *Bilingual and Biliteracy Skills in Young Spanish-Speaking Low-SES Children: Impact of Instructional Language and Primary Language Proficiency*. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 2, 144-159.
- [28] Cheung, A. C. and Slavin, R. E. (2012). *Effective Reading Programs for Spanish-Dominant English Language Learners (ELLs) in the Elementary Grades: A Synthesis of Research*. *Review of Educational Research*, 4, 351-395.
- [29] Baker, D. L., Burns, D., Kame'enui, E. J., Smolkowski, K. and Baker, S. K. (2016). *Does Supplemental Instruction Support the Transition from Spanish to English Reading Instruction for First-Grade English Learners at Risk of Reading Difficulties?* *Learning Disability Quarterly*, 4, 226-239.
- [30] Tong, F., Lara-Alecio, R., Irby, B., Mathes, P. and Kwok, O. M. (2008). *Accelerating Early Academic Oral English Development in Transitional Bilingual and Structured English Immersion Programs*. *American Educational Research Journal*, 4, 1011-1044.
- [31] Slavin, R. E., Madden, N., Calderón, M., Chamberlain, A. and Hennessy, M. (2011). *Reading and Language Outcomes of a Multiyear Randomized Evaluation of Transitional Bilingual Education*. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 1, 47-58.
- [32] Valentino, R. A. and Reardon, S. F. (2015). *Effectiveness of Four Instructional Programs Designed to Serve English Learners: Variation by Ethnicity and Initial English Proficiency*. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 4, 612-637.